

SHELBY COUNTY APPRAISAL REVIEW BOARD HEARING PROCEDURES

ARB Membership

[Tax Code Section 5.103(b)(16), (15), and (12)]

Administration of ARB Appointments

ARB members have no statutory role in the process for the administration of applications or requests for appointment for membership on the ARB. If an individual is contacted by an ARB member regarding requesting an appointment to the ARB, the member must direct the individual to the person designated to receive applications or requests for ARB appointment.

Conflicts of Interest

Each ARB member must ensure that he or she does not have any conflict of interest that results in ineligibility to serve on the ARB or that restricts or prohibits the ARB member's participation in ARB activities, such as participation in the determination of a taxpayer protest. An ARB member must promptly report any conflict of interest to the ARB chair in addition to any other individual or entity as required by law. The chair must ensure prompt notification of reported conflicts of interest to the appropriate individuals.

If an ARB member discovers before or during a protest hearing that a conflict of interest exists, the member cannot participate in a protest hearing. If the conflict exists due to the provisions of Local Government Code Chapter 171, the member must file an affidavit with the ARB secretary. The ARB member must file the affidavit as soon as the conflict is identified, even if it requires a delay in the conduct of the hearing. If the conflict arises from Tax Code Section 41.69, the ARB member does not have to file an affidavit but must recuse himself or herself immediately from the hearing and report the conflict to the ARB chair or secretary.

ARB members must remember that while Local Government Code Chapter 171 addresses matters of "substantial interest," Tax Code Section 41.69 applies to any protest in which an ARB member has interest (i.e. Tax Code Section 41.69 does not require the interest to be substantial). While a conflict of interest under Local Government Code Chapter 171 may not prohibit an ARB member from participation in a protest, Tax Code Section 41.69 may still prohibit participation. If an ARB member has a question as to whether he or she has a conflict of interest that might prohibit his or her involvement, the member must immediately contact the ARB chair to address the matter. In the recusal process, the ARB member cannot hear the protest, deliberate on the protest or vote on the matter that is the subject of the protest.

Ex Parte and Other Prohibited Communications

ARB members must not engage in prohibited ex parte or other communications. If one or more individuals approach the ARB member and appear to engage or attempt to engage in a prohibited communication, the ARB member must immediately remove himself or herself from the conversation.

ARB Duties

[Tax Code Section 5.103(b) (1), (5), and (6)]

Statutory Duties of an ARB

Each ARB member is responsible for ensuring that he or she understands the statutory duties of the ARB and shall comply with all statutory requirements in performing statutory duties as a member of the ARB.

Notices Required under the Property Tax Code

Each ARB member is responsible for obtaining and maintaining familiarity with notices required under the Property Tax Code. If an ARB member has reason to believe that any notice that is required by law to be provided by the ARB is not being provided or does not meet the requirements of applicable law, the ARB member shall promptly notify the ARB chair. The ARB chair shall investigate each such report and take appropriate action to correct all verified problems.

Determination of Good Cause

“Good cause” for filing late protests is not defined in Tax Code Section 41.44(b). Claims of good cause for late-filed protests must be carefully considered. The standards in making determinations of good cause under Tax Code Section 41.44(b) must be uniformly applied. The ARB should give due consideration to good cause claims in a manner that properly respects the rights of property owners and their agents while not undermining or contravening laws related to filing deadlines or the orderly and expeditious fulfillment of ARB duties.

ARB Hearings (formal hearings, not informal meetings between property owners and appraisal district staff)

[Tax Code Section 5.103(b)(3), (4), (7), and (14)]

Scheduling Hearings Generally

The ARB shall schedule a hearing when a timely notice of protest is filed and, in doing so, may be provided with clerical assistance by the appraisal district.

A person leasing property who is contractually obligated to reimburse the property owner for taxes imposed on the property is entitled to protest before the ARB the appraised value of the property if the property owner does not file a protest relating to the property. Under Tax Code Section 41.413, the lessee can designate another person to act as an agent with the same authority and limitations as an agent designated under Tax Code Section 1.111. Designated agents have the same authority and are subject to the same limitations as agents designated by property owners.

Scheduling Hearings for Property Owners, Agents and Qualifying Lessees

Pursuant to Tax Code Section 41.66(i), the ARB must schedule hearing requests filed by property owners or their designated agents under Tax Code Section 1.111 for a specific time and date. The ARB can schedule more than one protest hearing at the same time and date; however, the property owner or agent can request to postpone a hearing if it is not started by an ARB panel or the full ARB within two hours of the scheduled hearing time. The postponement request must contain the mailing address and email address of the person requesting the postponement. The ARB must respond in writing or by email to the postponement request not later than the 7th day after the date of receipt of the request.

Scheduling Hearings for Multiple Accounts

If requested by a property owner or designated agent, the ARB must schedule consecutive hearings on the same day on protests concerning up to 20 designated properties. The request must meet all requirements of Tax Code Section 41.66(j), including the required statement in boldfaced type: “request for same-day protest hearings.” A property owner or designated agent can file more than one such request in the same tax year. Also pursuant to Tax Code Section 41.66(j), the ARB may schedule protest hearings concerning more than 20 properties filed by the same property owner or designated agent and may use different panels to conduct the hearings based on the ARB’s customary scheduling. The ARB may follow the practices customarily used in the scheduling of hearings under Tax Code Section 41.66(j).

ARB Panel Assignments [Tax Code sections 41.66 (k)(k-1) and 41.45(d)(d1)]

Pursuant to Tax Code Section 41.66(k) and (k-1), if an ARB sits in panels as authorized by Tax Code Section 41.45(d) and (d-1), it must randomly assign protests. Except for panels established under Tax Code Section 6.425, the ARB, with or without clerical assistance from the appraisal district staff, may consider the property type or the protest grounds in order to assign the protest to a panel with members who have particular expertise.

Tax Code Section 41.45(b-4) allows a property owner to request that a single-member panel conduct the protest hearing. The property owner must submit the request not later than the 10th day before the hearing date in writing on the notice of protest or by a written submission. If the ARB does not accept the recommendations made by the single-panel member, the ARB can determine the protest or refer it for rehearing to a single-member panel composed of someone who did not hear the original protest.

Tax Code Section 41.66(k-1) allows a property owner or agent to request a special ARB panel to hear a complex property protest if in a county with a population of 1.2 million or more. The owner or agent must consent to a special panel reassignment and may request a postponement if they disagree with the reassignment.

Once a protest is scheduled for a specific panel, the ARB cannot reassign it to another panel without the consent of the property owner or designated agent. If the ARB reassigns a protest to another panel, the owner or designated agent may agree to the reassignment or request a postponement of the hearing. The ARB must postpone the hearing if requested in this situation. Pursuant to Tax Code Section 41.66(k), “[a] change of members of a panel because of a conflict of interest, illness, or inability to continue participating in hearings for the remainder of the day does not constitute reassignment of a protest to another panel.”

Postponements Under Tax Code Section 41.45(e)

A property owner who is not represented by an agent under Tax Code Section 1.111 is entitled to one postponement of a hearing without showing cause. The property owner must request the postponement before the hearing date in writing, including by fax, email, telephone or in person to the ARB, an ARB panel or the ARB chair. If the requested hearing postponement is scheduled to occur before the next regular meeting of the ARB, the chair or the chair’s representative may act on the request for postponement without the necessity of action by the full ARB. Unless the postponed hearing date and time are agreed to by the ARB chair or the chair’s representative, the property owner and the chief appraiser, the ARB cannot postpone the hearing to a date less than five or more than 30 days after the date scheduled for the hearing when the postponement is sought.

Without limit, the ARB must postpone a hearing to a later date if the property owner or designated agent shows good cause for the postponement, as defined in Tax Code Section 41.45(e-2). The property owner or designated agent must request the postponement in writing, including by fax, email, telephone or in

person to the ARB, an ARB panel or the ARB chair.

If the postponed hearing is rescheduled to occur before the next regular meeting of the ARB, the chair or the chair's representative can act on the postponement request without the necessity of action by the full ARB. Unless the postponed hearing date and time are agreed to by the ARB chair or the chair's representative, the property owner and the chief appraiser, the ARB cannot postpone the hearing to a date less than five or more than 30 days after the date scheduled for the hearing when the postponement is sought.

Without limit, the ARB must postpone a hearing to a later date if the chief appraiser consents to the postponement. The chief appraiser must request the postponement in writing, including by fax, email, telephone or in person to the ARB, an ARB panel or the ARB chair. If the postponed hearing is rescheduled to occur before the next regular meeting of the ARB, the chair or the chair's representative can act on the postponement request without the necessity of action by the full ARB. Unless the postponed hearing date and time are agreed to by the ARB chair or the chair's representative, the property owner and the chief appraiser, the ARB cannot postpone a hearing to a date less than five or more than 30 days after the date scheduled for the hearing when the postponement is sought. The postponement request must contain the mailing address and email address of the person requesting the postponement. The ARB must respond in writing or by email to the postponement request not later than the 7th day after the date of receipt of the request.

Postponements Under Tax Code Section 41.45(e-1)

A property owner or owner's agent who fails to appear at the hearing is entitled to a new hearing if the property owner or owner's agent files, not later than the fourth day after the date the hearing occurred, a written statement with the ARB showing good cause, as defined in Tax Code Section 41.45(e-2), for the failure to appear and requesting a new hearing. The postponement request must contain the mailing address and email address of the person requesting the postponement. The ARB must respond in writing or by email to the postponement request not later than the 7th day after the date of receipt of the request.

Postponements Under Tax Code Section 41.45(g)

The ARB must postpone a hearing to a later date if:

- 1) the property owner or the owner's agent is also scheduled to appear at an ARB protest hearing in another appraisal district;
- 2) the other scheduled ARB protest hearing is scheduled to occur on the same date as the hearing set by this ARB;
- 3) the hearing notice delivered to the property owner or the owner's agent by the other ARB bears an earlier postmark than the hearing notice delivered by this ARB or, if the postmark date is identical, the property owner or agent has not requested a postponement of the other hearing; and
- 4) the property owner or the owner's agent includes with the request for a postponement a copy of the notice of hearing delivered to the property owner or the owner's agent by the other ARB.

Postponements Under Tax Code Section 41.66(h)

The ARB must postpone a hearing (one time only) if the property owner or the designated agent requests additional time to prepare for the hearing and establishes that the chief appraiser failed to comply with Tax Code Section 41.461. The postponement request must contain the mailing address and email address of the person requesting the postponement. The ARB must respond in writing or by email to the postponement request not later than the 7th day after the date of receipt of the request.

Postponements Under Tax Code Section 41.66(i)

The ARB must schedule protest hearings filed by property owners or their designated agents under Tax

Code Section 1.111 for a specific time and date. The ARB can schedule more than one protest hearing at the same time and date; however, a property owner or agent can request to postpone a hearing if it is not started by an ARB panel or the full ARB within two hours of the scheduled hearing time. The postponement request must contain the mailing address and email address of the person requesting the postponement. The ARB must respond in writing or by email to the postponement request not later than the 7th day after the date of receipt of the request.

Postponements Under Tax Code Section 41.66(k)(k-1)

Once the ARB schedules a hearing by a specific panel, the ARB cannot reassign it to another panel without the consent of the property owner or designated agent. If the ARB reassigns a protest to another panel, a property owner or designated agent may agree to reassignment or request a hearing postponement. The ARB must postpone the hearing on that request. A change of panel members because of a conflict of interest, illness or inability to continue participating in hearings for the remainder of the day does not constitute panel reassignment.

A property owner or agent must consent to a special panel ARB hearing reassignment or request a postponement if they disagree with the reassignment. A change of special panel members because of a conflict of interest, illness or inability to continue participating in hearings for the remainder of the day does not constitute a special panel hearing reassignment.

The postponement request must contain the mailing address and email address of the person requesting the postponement. The ARB must respond in writing or by email to the postponement request not later than the 7th day after the date of receipt of the request.

Conduct of ARB Hearings (formal hearings, not informal meetings between property owners and appraisal district staff)

[Tax Code Section 5.103(b)(2), (9), and (10)]

Conducting Hearings Open to the Public

This introductory statement should be read at the beginning of each hearing:

“We are the appraisal review board (or panel) that will hear your protest today. We are not employees of the appraisal district. We are appointed to perform an independent review of your protest. You can complete a survey regarding your experience today [provide instructions on how to fill out the survey]. The survey is voluntary. You also have the right to appeal our decision. We will provide the appeal information to you with our determination.”

The ARB or ARB panel does not have to read the statement above if the owner or agent has previously appeared before the ARB or any ARB panel for the ARB for that county that same day.

For most protest hearings, the hearing should be conducted in the following order:

- a) Commence the hearing and announce the assigned protest number, property location, property owner, and other identifying information.
- b) Announce that, in accordance with Tax Code Section 41.45(h), all written and electronic material that has not been provided must be provided.
- c) State that the ARB members who are considering the protest have not communicated with anyone about the protest and have signed affidavits to that effect.
- d) Welcome the parties and remind them of the content of the hearing procedures, time limits for the hearing, and other relevant matters.
- e) Ask if any testifying witness holds a license or certificate from the Texas Appraiser Licensing and Certification Board and if the witness is appearing in that capacity.

- f) Inform witnesses that all testimony must be given under oath and swear-in all witnesses who plan to testify.
- g) Ask the property owner to decide if he/she wishes to present his/her evidence and argument before or after the appraisal district.
- h) If the property owner or agent presents his/her case first, he/she shall present evidence (documents and/or testimony). If witnesses are present, the property owner or agent may examine the witnesses as part of the presentation of evidence. At the end of the presentation, an opinion of value (if applicable) for the property must be stated.
- i) Next, the appraisal district representative may cross-examine the property owner, the agent, or the representative and/or witnesses.
- j) If the property owner or agent presented his/her case first, the appraisal district representative shall present evidence (documents and/or testimony) next. If witnesses are present, the appraisal district representative may examine the witnesses as part of the presentation of evidence. At the end of the presentation, an opinion of value (if applicable) for the property must be stated.
- k) Then, the property owner or agent may cross-examine the appraisal district representative and/or witnesses.
- l) Members of the ARB shall not be examined or cross-examined by parties.
- m) The party presenting its case first may offer rebuttal evidence (additional evidence to refute evidence presented by the other party).
- n) The other party may then offer rebuttal evidence.
- o) The party presenting its case first shall make its closing argument and state the ARB determination being sought.
- p) The party presenting its case second shall make its closing argument and state the ARB determination being sought.
- q) The ARB or panel chair shall state that the hearing is closed.
- r) The ARB or panel shall deliberate orally. No notes, text messages, or other forms of written communication are permitted.
- s) The ARB or panel chairman must ask for a separate motion for each matter that was the subject of the protest hearing. The motion should include the exact value or issue protested. The ARB must take a vote and a designated appraisal district staff person or ARB member must record it. The parties must make separate motions and the ARB must make separate determinations for each protested issue (i.e., excessive appraisal and unequal appraisal must have separate ARB motions and determinations). Single-member panels must make a recommendation on each motion submitted under protest, however, the ARB will ultimately accept the panel's determination, make its own determination on the protest, or refer the matter for rehearing to a single-member panel composed of someone who did not hear the original protest. Special panels appointed in certain counties must make a recommendation on each motion submitted under protest, however, the ARB for rehearing to another special panel composed of members who did not hear the original protest. If ARB does not have at least three other special panel members available, the ARB may make the determination.
- t) Thank the parties for their participation and announce the ARB determination(s) and that an order determining protest will be sent. Provide the property owner or agent documents indicating that the members of the board hearing the protest signed the required affidavit.

If the ARB members use computer screens during ARB hearings for reviewing evidence and other information, the ARB must make computer screens available to property owners and agents at the hearings to view the same information that is presented to the ARB members by the appraisal district staff. This requirement is met if the property owner or agent can see all information displayed on at least one computer screen in the hearing location (there is no requirement that the ARB provide the property owner or agent with a separate screen). If a chief appraiser uses audiovisual equipment at a protest hearing, the appraisal office must provide equipment of the same general type, kind and character for the use of the property owner or agent during the hearing. See section VI, Other Issues, for more information

regarding audiovisual equipment requirements.

The property owner or agent and the appraisal district representative are prohibited from debating each other. The parties must direct all communications to the ARB members, except for examination or cross-examination during testimony of witnesses or parties testifying at the hearing.

For taxing unit challenges, motions to correct appraisal records, protests regarding exemptions, or other matters that may be the subject of ARB hearings, the ARB should follow the order of conducting hearings above but may make exceptions for the type of hearing. Tax Code Section 41.68 and Comptroller Rule 9.803 require that the ARB keep records for each ARB proceeding. This includes the ARB retaining evidence offered or submitted by the parties as required by Tax Code Section 41.45 and Comptroller rules 9.803 and 9.805. The ARB secretary is responsible for ensuring proper record keeping, maintenance and retention.

Conducting Hearings by Telephone Conference Call

Tax Code Section 41.45(n) allows a property owner initiating a protest can offer evidence or argument by affidavit without physically appearing. Tax Code Section 41.45(b-1) requires a property owner to notify the ARB by written request not later than the 10th day before the date of the hearing if the property intends to appear remotely.

To offer evidence or argument at a hearing conducted remotely, a property owner must submit a written affidavit of any evidence before the hearing begins. A property owner is responsible for providing access to a hearing conducted remotely to another person the owner invites to participate in the hearing.

Tax Code Section 41.45(b-2) requires the ARB to provide the telephone number for conducting the teleconference call or the URL address for conducting the videoconference (if offered in that county). The ARB must hold the hearing in a location with equipment that allows all ARB members and parties to the protest in attendance to hear and, if applicable, see the property owner's argument.

Conducting Hearings Closed to the Public

Tax Code Section 41.66(d) states that hearings conducted under this chapter are open to the public. Tax Code Section 41.66(d-1) allows the hearing to be closed to the public by mutual agreement between the property owner and the chief appraiser. The chief appraiser and the property owner must file a joint motion to request a closed hearing due to intent to disclose proprietary or confidential information that will assist the ARB in determining the protest.

ARB or panel chair must convene the hearing as an open meeting and then announce the closed meeting as permitted by Tax Code Section 41.66(d) and (d-1). Only the parties to the protest, their witnesses and the ARB members are permitted to stay in the hearing room. The ARB must follow the same order of proceedings as for hearings open to the public.

The ARB secretary must keep a separate tape recording or written summary of testimony for the closed meeting in accordance with Comptroller Rule 9.803, generally. The proprietary or confidential evidence presented at the hearing giving rise to the closed hearing is confidential according to Tax Code Section 22.27. The ARB must mark as "confidential" and maintain it as confidential in the ARB records for proper handling. At the conclusion of the hearing, the ARB panel must confirm with the parties that all proprietary and confidential information has been appropriately identified by the ARB. The ARB members must maintain the confidentiality of the information and disclose only as provided by law.

After deliberation, the ARB must reconvene in open meeting and vote or take final action on the protest deliberated in the closed meeting. The ARB and parties cannot mention the proprietary or confidential

information during the open meeting.

Right to Examine and Cross-Examine Witnesses or Other Parties

Tax Code Section 41.66(b) states that “each party to a hearing is entitled to offer evidence, examine or cross-examine witnesses or other parties, and present argument on the matters subject to the hearing.” The ARB may not prohibit this entitlement in any way; however, it may enforce time limits and dictate the order of ARB hearings for witness examination and cross-examination. To the extent possible, the parties should be advised in advance of any time limitations the ARB has determined to impose regarding the presentation of evidence.

Party’s Right to Appear by an Agent

The ARB shall accept and consider a motion or protest filed by an agent if an agency authorization is filed at or before the hearing on the motion or protest. The ARB may not require that an agency authorization be filed at an earlier time. The ARB may not require a person to designate an agent to represent the person in a property tax matter other than as provided by Tax Code Section 1.111.

A person leasing property who is contractually obligated to reimburse the property owner for taxes imposed on the property is entitled to file a protest if the property owner does not and to designate, under Tax Code Section 41.413, another person to act as his/her agent with the same authority and limitations as an agent designated under Tax Code Section 1.111.

Evidence Considerations

[Tax Code Section 5.103(8), (11), and (13)]

A Party’s Right to Offer Evidence and Argument

The ARB cannot prohibit a party’s right to offer evidence and argument. However, the ARB may enforce time limits and dictate the order of ARB hearings. To the extent possible, the parties should be advised in advance of any time limitations the ARB has determined to impose regarding the presentation of evidence and argument. The ARB should, schedule permitting, provide as much time as possible to each party to a hearing to fully present evidence and offer argument.

Prohibition of Consideration of Information Not Provided at the ARB Hearing

[Tax Code Section 41.66(e)]

In a protest hearing, the ARB cannot consider any appraisal district information on a protest that was not presented to the ARB during the protest hearing. In order for the ARB to consider any appraisal district record (i.e., appraisal roll history, appraisal cards), one of the parties must present it as evidence (e.g., chief appraiser, appraisal district representative, property owner, agent or witness) at the protest hearing.

Exclusion of Evidence Required by Tax Code Section 41.67(d), (e)

If it is established during a protest hearing that the protesting party previously requested information under Tax Code Section 41.461 and that the opposing party did not deliver the information to the protesting party at least 14 days before the scheduled or postponed hearing, the opposing party cannot use or offer the requested information not made available in any form as evidence in the hearing. The ARB must exclude evidence under Tax Code Section 41.67(d) only if evidence presented at the hearing establishes that:

1) the information sought to be excluded as evidence was not delivered at least 14 days before the hearing; and 2) the information sought to be excluded as evidence was previously requested by the protesting party.

Tax Code Section 41.67(e) prohibits the chief appraiser from offering evidence at a hearing in support

of a modification or denial of an exemption of application unless:

- 1) the chief appraiser provided the reasoning for the modification or denial to the property owner in writing no later than the 14th day before the hearing date; and
- 2) evidence establishes that the additional reason was not known by the chief appraiser at the time the chief appraiser delivered the original notice of modification or denial.

VI. Other Issues

[Tax Code Section 5.103(17)]

1. Compliance with the Law, Integrity, and Impartiality:

ARB members must comply with the law and always act in a manner that promotes public confidence in the integrity and impartiality of the ARB.

2. Patience and Courtesy:

ARB members must be patient, dignified and courteous to parties appearing before the ARB.

3. Bias or Prejudice:

ARB members must perform their ARB duties without bias or prejudice.

4. Confidential Information:

ARB members must not disclose or use confidential information acquired in the performance of ARB duties for any purpose unrelated to ARB duties. Appraisal Review Board Evidence Exchange and Retention and Audiovisual Equipment Requirements

(a) Exchange of evidence. Before or immediately after an appraisal review board hearing begins, the appraisal district and the property owner or the owner's agent shall each provide the other party with a duplicated set of the evidentiary materials the person intends to offer or submit to the appraisal review board for consideration at the hearing. One set of these materials is to be exchanged with and retained by the other party, and another set of these materials is to be provided to and retained by the appraisal review board as evidence for its records. The duplicated material sets shall be produced in either paper or electronic form.

(b) Evidentiary materials on a portable electronic device. Evidentiary materials produced on a portable electronic device shall be saved in a file format type and downloaded to a small, portable, electronic device. The file format type and small, portable, electronic device must be considered generally accepted technology and must be suitable for retention by the recipient. For security purposes, the electronic files on devices produced pursuant to this section shall be capable of being scanned or reviewed for the presence of any malicious software or computer viruses before acceptance by or exposure to the recipient's computer system.

(c) Electronic file format types and devices. The ARB considers the following file formats acceptable: Adobe portable document format (PDF); Microsoft Word, typically used for text documents; Microsoft Excel, typically used for spreadsheets and tables; Microsoft PowerPoint, typically used for presentations or slideshows; and JPEG (jpg or .jpeg) for photographs. The ARB considers the following small, portable, electronic devices suitable for retention acceptable: USB flash drives (i.e., thumb or jump drives, USB or memory sticks), compact discs/CDs, and DVDs. The appraisal district and the property owner or the owner's agent may agree to exchange evidence in a manner other than provided in appraisal review board hearing procedures so long as a copy of the evidence may be retained in the records of the appraisal review board and satisfies the requirements of subsection (a) of this section.

(d) The appraisal district uses audiovisual equipment at appraisal review board hearings, including a television monitor compatible with a PC or DVD player, and shall make this equipment available for use by the property owner or the owner's agent at the hearing. In the alternative, property owners and their agents may bring their own audiovisual equipment for their presentation of evidentiary materials at appraisal review board hearings. If the operation of audiovisual equipment at the hearing requires access to and connection with the Internet for the presentation, the parties must provide their own Internet connection and access through their own service provider. The property owner and the owner's agent may not access the appraisal district office's network or Internet connection nor any of the appraisal district office's technology or equipment other than that made available under this section and described in the appraisal review board hearing procedures. The appraisal district and the property owner or the owner's agent may use audiovisual equipment with specifications that are different from those in the hearing procedures if the parties agree to do so in writing or verbally agree as shown in the audio recording of the hearing.

Approved this 3RD day of APRIL, 2025.